

Unseen existences: Stories of life from Venembeli, Papua New Guinea

Nogat Luksave: Stori bilong laip long Venembeli, Papua Niugini

Authors/Husait raitim buk: Charles Roche, Rochelle Spencer, Eugene John, Nawasio Walim, Howard Sindana and the Venembeli Community

This is a summarised, less formal and translated version of a longer research article entitled *Unseen existences: Stories of life from Venembeli, Papua New Guinea*. Article numbering relates to the original article, which is an academic and referenced version. Copies and more information is available from Charles, via charles.roche@murdoch.edu.au or phone +6145901714 or Howard on +675 7141 0311.

Dispela em moa sotpela ripot blong lo ngpela wok painimaut ripot taitel o nem Nogat luksave: Stori bilong laip long Venembeli, Papua Niugini. Namba long ripot istap long soim nambawan ripot bilong bikpela save moa na blong referens. Ol kopi na moa toktok save istap long Charles, email: Charles.roche@murdoch.edu.au o fon +6145901714 o Howard fon +675 7141 0311.

1. Preface: Seeing Venembeli/Luksave moa yet long Venembeli

Built around a hill and nestled amongst peaks on all sides, the sun does not rise quickly in Venembeli. With the light comes the sound; roosters crowing, pigs squealing, dogs wrestling, birds singing and beetles rustling, alongside the sound of splashing water nearby and the thrum of the river at the bottom of the hill. Before the sun takes over, the lights from houses shine brightly as they illuminate their surrounds through the night. The recent advent of affordable solar has made artificial light a reality, a fact that the constant illumination seems to celebrate, or at least bear witness to. Then come the sounds of people, children waking, beginning to play; women starting their daily work, clinking pots, lighting fires, and preparing *kaikai* (food). The volume rises as the light slowly increases with the direct beams of sunlight making their way up the hillside.

Ples Istap long maunten na sindaun gut namel long het blong maunten banisim olgeta hap, san ino save kam antap haraip long Venembeli. Taim lait ikam wantaim nois; ol kakaruk ikrai, ol pik mekim nois, ol dog singaut, ol pisin singsing na ol binatang kirapim nois blong ol, namel long nois blong wara istap klostu na bihainim rot blong em igo daun tamblo long ass blong maunten. Bipo long san ilait na kisim ples, ol lait blong haus ilait gut tru long nait. Wantaim senis blong solar ikam insait mekim laip kam gut, mekim driman blong ol lukim senis ikamap nau long taim blong ol. Na manmeri kirap toktok, pikinini wakabaut, stat long pilai; meri statim wok blong de, pairapim pot, laitim paia, na redim kaikai. Plenti nois kamap taim tulait ikam na san lait ikam mekim ol wakabaut igo bihainim sait blong maunten.

There are 90 houses in Venembeli built mainly using bush materials from over ten species of *diwai* (tree). Roofs are made of overlapping sago leaves and kunai grass; floors from sawn timber beams or split bamboo (see Fig 1.). Many of the homes display modern additions such as steel ridge capping, steel roofs (*kapa*) and netted windows. There are some houses that would not look out of place in Lae, the capital of Morobe Province, with interior walls lined and painted. The houses are scattered in small clusters, an organic and friendly layout that both connects and separates extended families. These clusters are surrounded by many fruiting trees including; rambutan, guava, coconut, mango, pineapple, banana, sago, *galip* nut, pawpaw, breadfruit and pandanus, as well as *buai* (chewed with mustard and lime to produce a mild stimulant), *noni* (a medicinal plant), herbs and bright colourful flowering plants - the village is vibrant with life. Next to, or adjoining most houses is the kitchen, another elevated structure typically made from bush materials. Inside, sitting on a rectangle of dirt and

ash is the wood fire, a slow-burning masterpiece that generates enough heat for cooking without wasting fuel or producing excessive heat or smoke. A set of bush pole shelves, with washed pots, cups, plates and utensils sits either inside or just outside the kitchen. Not every house has a tap, but our house has running water outdoors, gravity-fed from a small dam further up the hill.

Venembeli igat 90pela haus na ol mekim haus long bus materal we ol usim tenpela kain diwai blong mekim haus. Na lip blong saksak na kunai grass ol usim long karamapim haus long em; na floor ol usim palang ol katim long chain-saw o mambu ol splitim na putim long floor. Plenti blong haus ol mekim hapkas haus long iron ridge cap, kappa na net window.(see Fig 1.). Igat sampela haus ol bai ino luk aut off place long Lae, capital blong Morobe Provins, ol banisim gut tru insait na paintim. Ol haus istap longwe liklik blong ol yet, em gutpla tru bung famili na banisim arapela famili tu. Dispela liklik haus igat plenti prut diwai gro arere olsem, rambutan, guava, kokonas, mango, pineapple, mango, saksak, galip nut, pawpaw, kapiak na marita, buai tu (ol kaikai wantaim daka long mekim manmeri ai op), noni (marasin diwai), herb na bright kalaful flawa diwai, ples em holim gut tru laip. Arere long ol haus em kitchen istap, ol imekim gut tru long bus material, ol mekim ples blong mekim pia wantaim ol box diwai na pipia blong graun na piawud kamapim shit blong pia ples. Liklik pia ples save kamapim inap pia blong kuk na inogat blong wastim fuel or kirapim bikpela pia or smuk. Ol kapbod ol imekim long bun diwai blong bush, we ol pot, kap, plate na arapela iwasim pinis istap long em o arapela istap autsait long kitechen. Ino olgeta haus igat tapwara, tasol haus blong mipela igat wara ron outside, em ron long presa blong dam istap antap long mauntain ikam daun.

[insert] **Fig 1. Venembeli**

Home to over four hundred people, 40 per cent of whom are children, Venembeli is in a state of transition, adjusting to the influences and impacts of colonisation, Christianity, cultural change and the fluctuations of the international gold price. This is neither a traditional paradise nor a modern dis/utopia; just a community trying to maintain traditions and adapt to change. Venembeli, along with the nearby villages of Hekeng and Nambonga are predominantly subsistence-based, relying on the local environment for their drinking and washing water, bush (gathering, hunting, fishing) and garden foods, medicines, housing materials, cash crops, alluvial mining, play and cultural uses. Like many other communities in Papua New Guinea (PNG), Venembeli is largely Christian but retains beliefs and customs following older, pre-Christian traditions. Gender divisions are sharp and reflected in the overwhelming male-dominated leadership structures, domestic roles, gardening, socialising, and disparate levels of education, voice and power. All three villages are expected to be resettled to allow the proposed Wafi-Golpu mine to proceed; in Venembeli's case, the proposed resettlement location is now uncertain, but at the time of research (2020) there were no resettlement options near a river comparable to the Wafi River.

Venembeli em ples igat moa long four handet manmeri (400 manmeri), 40 per cent em ol pikinini, Venembeli istap long senis, divilopmen blong autsait lain, Kristeniti, kastom pasin isenis na pais blong gold long international maket wok long igam. Em ino pasin blong ples o blong arapela lain autsait, em kominiti traim long holim bek pasin kastom na adoptim senis wok long kamap. Venembeli wantaim tupela ples Hekeng na Nambonga depend long graun, bus na wara long painim abus, pis na gaden kaikai, marasin, mekim haus, cash crop, wok gold, pilai na wok blong kastom. Wankain olsem ol arapela kominiti long Papua Niugini (PNG), Venembeli em bikpela Kristen kominiti tasol em holim bek olupela kastom blong Kristian Sios. Gender o luksave blong man na meri em kamap ples klia, taim man igam pas moa long holim lidaship position, wok blong haus/ples, gaden, manmeri, sot long lainim long skul, toktok na pawa. Olgeta tripela ples bai lusim graun blong ol na igam (relocate) sindaun long

narapela ples na proposed Wafi Golpu main long igo het. Case blong Venembeli long tingting blong resettlement nau em ino kamap klia, long taim blong wok painimaut/research/ (2020) ino bin igat resettlemen plen long settlim long wankain wara olsem Wafi wara.

2. Introduction/Stat

Using an emancipatory, participatory action research (PAR) approach to intentionally serve those who are at risk of becoming marginalised and dispossessed by mining development, we share stories about life and relationships in Venembeli, a remote village situated 65km southwest of Lae, capital of Morobe Province, PNG. Together we make a clear statement of existence and life that does not require another event to define it. Mindful of the power of language and dominant cultures, we adopt a refined version of the Melanesian *tok stori* (literally, to share stories) methodology, which we describe as *tok stori-tok ples* (sharing stories in local language), as we sought to uncover and describe some truths about human and environmental relations in the village of Venembeli.

Pasin blong luksave long ol yet husait, Participate Action research (PAR) min long helpim ol luksave long bagarap ol istap long em, control na bagarap maining divilopmen bai mekim, mipela serim stori blong laip na sindaun insait long Venembeli, ples istap 65km southwest blong Lae, bikpla taun blong Morobe Provins-PNG. Wokbung wantaim imekim kamap ples klia save blong istap laip we narapela ino inap long tokaut long tok tru blong laip blong manmeri. Luksave long pawa blong toktok na pasin blong outsait lain, mipela adoptim Melanesian *tok stori* (em blong stori moa yet) methodology, we mipela discribim olsem *tok stori-tok ples*(sharim stori long tokple),, mipela mekim long luksave na kisim trupela meaning blong manmeri na bus,graun na wara blong ples Venembeli.

Conversely, the reality is that our interest in Venembeli, along with many readers and stakeholders, was prompted by development interests from the Global North. In this case, a proposed mine that positions Venembeli as a contentious site of opportunity and impact. Venembeli typifies how our attention to, and interest in, the value of others' existence is often not appreciated until a Western development scheme is proposed; a sad indictment on our assumptions about people, social change, and development. Nevertheless, we seek to better understand and assist the community by responding to an assessment and approval process for the Wafi-Golpu mine that has failed to genuinely 'see' and hear the people who live in Venembeli. Indeed, the main impact assessment document, the environmental impact statement (EIS), has instead rendered the villagers of Venembeli as two-dimensional beings and their land fit only for mineral exploitation. This regulatory attempt at assessment gives primacy to identifying potential positive intentional development outcomes while it minimises or ignores the many potential negative mining legacies created by both intentional and unplanned (immanent) development. We deliberately counter this dispossessive process with a glimpse of the community that is Venembeli. Our approach can thus be compared to a mining design, impact assessment and technocratic approval process that prioritises the mining over local ways of living.

Long tok tru, mipela igat interest long wok long Venembeli, wantaim plenti readers na stakeholders long divilopment interest ikam long Global North. Long kain case istap long plen kamapim Venembeli strongpla eria blong gutpela na impact. Venembeli inapim tingting na bel blong mipela long luksave long value blong sindaun blong manmeri

3. Methodology

These stories were recorded over four visits to Venembeli throughout 2019 and 2020, which built on an ongoing engagement with the community since 2014. Some of the stories were shared at the river where villagers gather to wash bodies, clothes and dishes, to play and to engage in alluvial mining. Other stories were shared during research briefings and discussions stemming from research in previous years, spontaneous conversations while preparing or eating *kaikai* and drinking tea, when villagers deliberately sought information from the visiting researchers, or in meetings under houses away from the hot sun. Most conversations attracted others, a sort of organic tropical snowballing recruitment that drew in new community co-researchers. Interviews were in English or *Tok Pisin* with notes and quotes translated by the authors in the field and at an end-of-trip two-day workshop.

Dispela ol stori igo insait long rekot bihainm fopela (4pela) wakabaut igo insait long Venembeli namel long 2019 na 2020, dispela wokbung wantaim kominiti stat long 2014. Sampela stori ibin kamap ples klia taim ples manmeri igo daun long waswas, wasim klos na dish, pilai na wok gol. Ol arapela stori ibin kamap long taim blong research briefing na toktok moa igo insait long research blong yia igo pinis, longpela toktok igo ikam long taim blong wok redi o kaikai na dring tea, taim manmeri long ples painim information long researchers, o miting aninit long haus long taim sun hot. Plenti stori ikirapim arapela stori na kirapim ass tru long stori blong research, dispela imekim nupela recruitment blong kominiti research team. Olgeta interviews istap long English or Tok Pisin wantaim notes na quotes ol authors tanim tok long field na long pinis blong patrol em tupela de woksop.

[insert] **Fig 2. Tok stori-tok ples by the River**

4.0 Stories of life from Venembeli/**Laip Stori blong Venembeli**

These vignettes are a sample of the social complexity of life in Venembeli and the distinctive role the River has in people's lives. There are also other stories away from the River, and as such, these stories should be read as an example of more widespread connections and relations rather than as outliers. Below, using the experiences of children, village courtship, the experiences of women and food, we tell of relationships, connections, sustenance and social recreation.

Dispela em tokpiksa blong manmeri lukluk igo insait moa yet long laip long Venembeli na wanem wok wara mekim long laip blong olgeta man na meri. Igat tu arapela stori longwe long wara olsem na dispela ol stori imas istap olsem tokpiksa o example blong strongpla connection na wokbung na ino giaman lain. Tamblo, usim experiens blong pikinini, village courtship, experiens blong meri na kaikai, mipela tokaut long wokbung o connection, how ol istap gut na manmeri amamas olsem wanem.

[insert] **Fig 3. Pikinini's playing in the River**

4.1 Children/**Pikininis**

Venembeli children spend at least a part (several hours or more) of everyday playing in and adjacent to the Wafi River. In PNG, children often have much more freedom and independence than is conceivable in the industrial cities of the metropole. Think of long walks, young children imitating their parents and skilfully using large bush-knives, free to climb high trees for coconuts or play for hours, away from the direct gaze of parents. In Venembeli, we witnessed small groups of 3-6, or in larger swarms of 10+ children playing in the waters of the River, along its banks and in the Village. The children play a seemingly universal game of diving for treasure, in this case for a white stone that stands out from the otherwise washed smooth grey river stones. Fig 3. depicts two children at play in the River, along with

the motion and joy captured by Eugene, the image evokes the sounds of water, joyful shrieks of children, the hum of the forest and the smell of cool freshwater on a hot day.

Pikinini long Venembeli save pilai long Wafi Wara olgeta dei. Long PNG, pikinini oltaim save igat moa fridom na independent moa long bikpla taun na siti. Tingting long longpla wakabaut, ol yangpla pikinini bihainim papamama na ol save gut how long usim bikpla bus naip, ol free long go antap long longpla diwai kokonas o pilai longpela hours taim papamama ino istap. Long Venembeli, mipela ilukim liklik grup pikinini 3-6, o bikpla 10+ pikinini pilai long namel blong wara, arere na long ples. Ol pikinini igat pilai blong wara we ogeta save em long swim igo insait long bed blong wara long painim wanpela white ston or grey kala ston blong wara. Fig 3. Piksa tupla pikinini pilai long wara, muv na pilai amamas piksa Eugene kisim, piksa tokaut long nois blong wara, naispela amamas blong ol pikinini, bus na smell blong klinpla wara long hot san.

At other times children played land-based games on the River flats with balls, sticks and imaginary items and beings that adult researchers could fail to see. Marbles (small, toughened glass balls) is widely and continuously played, with moving versions of the game as well as the usual universal circle, which often attracted larger groups and spectators. The groups, while often dominated by older boys, included many girls and ranged in age from approximately 4-12 years. As they grew older, children played less by the River, though they could be seen assisting the women with washing, gardening and cooking or undertaking their own alluvial mining activities from an early age.

Long arapela taim ol pikinini pilai arere wara long graun wantaim ball, stik na arapela hait piksa istap long tingting we bikpela researchers ino inap long luksave. Marbles (strongpla liklik round glass ball) em olgeta lain save long pilai na dispela pulim moa grup long kam lukluk.

[insert] Fig 4. Complex river relationships

From what we observed, the River performs many valuable functions for children, not limited to a site of free and imaginative play, unsupervised time, washing and swimming, and teaching each other how to obtain their own bush foods. In addition, the River also acts as an entertainer, babysitter and teacher, giving time and space for the parents to undertake daily tasks (gardens, mining, community), care for smaller children or find time to themselves. While group relationships are not always harmonious, acts of care are common amongst the children, such as helping a younger child reach a favoured spot on the opposite riverbank, or helping them crush open the *garlip* nuts with rocks. This time spent together is vital in the formation of oneself in today's relationships and in the relationships that would come to form the basis for village relations in the future. The relationships between people and the River is captured in Fig 4., which shows a complex river life that imbues the quotidian routines of the Village; people are a part of, not apart from, the River.

Long luksave blong mipela, wara igat plenty gutpela samting blong ol pikinini, ino blong pilai tasol, ol gat taim blong ol yet, waswas na swim, skulim ol yet how long painim kaikai long bus. Moa yet long dispela, wara em kamap olsem show graun blong ol, em olsem baby sitter na tisa, na givim taim long papamama mekim ol wok blong wanwan de (gaden, wok gol, kominiti wok). Lukautim ol liklik pikinini o painim taim blong ol yet. Taim grup bung em ino gutpela tumas, ol pikinini igat gutpela luksave namel long ol yet, kain olsem helivim liklik pikinini igo long favourite hap blong em long sait blong wara, o brukim garlip long ston. Dispela taim ol istap wantaim em gutpela blong ol yet long pasin poroman na long kain poroman pasin strongim ples long bihain taim tu. Wok bung na poroman namel

long manmeri na wara em istap long Piksa 4., dispela isoim long bikpela sapot tru wara imekim long laif blong manmeri blong ples; manmeri connect long wara, ino istap longwe, wara em laip.

4.2 Courtship/*Taim blong bung na stori*

This next *stori* surprised us, as despite earlier visits over five years, we had not been privy to this particular story, which captures the importance of the River for gender relations in Venembeli. But while the *stori* is a positive one illustrating daily life, complex relations and connectivity, it first requires an understanding of the customary gendered relations in a PNG village to appreciate the way the River flows through village life and reproduction.

Mipela ikirap nogut long dispela stori, mipela ibin igat moa long faivpela yias, mipela ino bin igat sans long save long displa stori. Dispela karamapim bikpela luksave blong wara long man na meri bungim ol yet long Venembeli. Dispela em positive stori kamapim ples klia laip blong ples, bikpela stori na touchim na nidim luksave blong kastom rot blong man na meri insait long PNG ples lain long luksave long how wara em igat meaning long ples laip na strongim famili.

The typical gendered divisions in semi-subsistence communities in PNG are apparent in daily life, where women and girls are responsible for: cleaning of dishes, clothes, houses and young bodies; firewood collection and cooking; water carrying; child rearing and the bulk of the day-to-day work in the gardens. Separation by gender is evident in daily conversations, at church services and in activities during free time, though familial relations often cross these gendered boundaries. These gendered roles and separation are indicative of the wider situation in PNG, which has a record of gendered inequality and violence. The nature of gendered relations is observable in towns and remote villages alike and readily apparent in PNG Facebook conversations that often document domestic abuse and promote the submission of women to their husbands (first author's own experience).

Igat narakain luksave long man na meri insait long PNG kominiti long olgeta de, ol mama na yangpla meri igat wok mak blong ol long; wasim dish, klos, haus na wasim pikinini, painim piawud na kukim kaikai, karim wara, lukautim pikinini na plenti wok olgeta de long gaden. Man istap separate long meri mekim ol toktok, insait long lotu na arapla wok autsait tu, na rot blong famili tu strongim. Wok blong man na meri istap ples klia insait long PNG, igat rekot tokaut long inequality/pasin ino stret o kros pait. Dispela luksave blong violence kamap long ol taun na ol ples na PNG Facebook stori long domestic abuse or hevi blong meri na man ilaikim meri mas istap inininit long man (experiens blong nambawan author).

[insert] **Fig 5. Flirting**

During 2019 we heard stories of the River as a site of flirtation, away from the fixed and dominant gender divisions in the village. Young women and men would mix freely away from the observation of parents and village or church leaders. We learnt that the River is a site of personal exploration where future marital and other relationships are formed or strengthened, constituting a vital part of village relations and reproduction. In this way, the River becomes a space where a transformation of the customary gender norms occurs; a space where young women and men practice ritual-like flirtations and explore relationships.

Long 2019 mipla harim ol stori blong wara long aigris o mangal, autsait long ples. Yangpela man na meri bai mix raun hait long papamam, ples na sios lidas. Mipela lainim save osem wara em ples blong wanpela luksave long em yet long bihain marit or arapela wok poroman kamap strong bihainim

relationship na kamapim familit laip. Long dispela kain rot, wara ikamap ples blong kirapim kastom rot blong man na meri wok long kamap, ples blong yangpla meri na man mekim kamap pilai o mangal blong ol long strongim painim poroman/poromeri.

In this case, the behaviours and social relations that occur at the River (the liminal space) are distinct from the gendered norms adhered to in the Village. During our *tok stori-tok ples* conversations, women shared stories of these encounters and ‘boyfriends’ from the past to much communal laughter. The women would splash the water, creating sounds that attracted the young men, who often shared gifts such as fish or *baui*, either given directly or through intermediaries such as younger siblings (See Fig 5.). One co-researcher explained the “*river is a place where men and women start their friendship*”. Perhaps just as importantly, the River enables youth to choose their own prospective partners rather than the more traditional approach where parents guide or organise marriages. Eugene captured some of the encounters shared with us, such as in the composite image of Fig 6., which depicts three scenes, including an in-river encounter and a young couple walking back to the Village.

Long dispela as, pasin na wokporoman kamap long wara ino bihainim pasin blong ples. Long taim blong ol *tok stori-tok ples* stori blong mipela, ol meri tokaut long how ol mekim wantaim boipren long bipo na bikpela lap kirap. Ol meri save pairapim wara long kirapim nois long toksave long yangpla man husait ol save serim pis or buai ol yet o givim long narapla pikinini igo givim (lukim piksa 5.). Wanpla tim researcher tokaut olsem “wara em ples we man na meri statim friendship”. Long luksave gut tru, wara imekim ol yangpela long luksave long poroman o poromeri ol yet na ino olupela pasin we papamama bai helpim na makim meri o man long maritim. Eugene kisim ol stori serim wantaim mipla kain piksa long Fig 6., dispela karamapim tripla (3pla) stori piksa, wanpla insait long wara na narapla nupela marit wakabaut igo bek long ples.

[insert] **Fig 6. River romance/Wara Bung**

In early 2020, when we revisited the stories with community members, an even deeper story emerged. Where previously the River was described as a meeting place, we now heard that it was also the site, or formation of, otherwise illicit (by community standards) relationships that resulted in pregnancy and sometimes marriage. The stories indicated a willingness of the youth to flout village rules on courtship and sex, violating social norms and spurning traditional beliefs about the danger to one’s physical health of having sex in the bush. This generational contest over courting, marriage and sex is hardly new or unique to Venembeli, but rather indicates a more common experience with cultural change driven by exposure to outside ideas, values and customs.

Long stat blong 2020, taim mipela igo bek gen long manmeri long kominiti, ibin igat bikpela stori istap hait ikamap klia. Pastaim wara ol ibin tok olsem wara em ples bung, mipela nau harim olsem em hap ples blong mekim pasin hait o ino stret long lukluk o standard blong kominiti we meri em bel na marit. Stori itokaut long yangpela ino bihainim loa blong ples bungim bodi na koap, brukim tok tambu blong ples o kastom bilip long nogut blong sik kamap long bodi taim kuap long bus. Dispela pasin blong bungim bodi, marit na kuap em ino nupela samting long Venembeli, em soim ples klia wankain experiens we pasin blong ples em senis taim manmeri pilim na lukim save blong autsait, bilip na pasin.

While we appreciated the story’s new complexity and the resistance and romance of the non-sanctioned relationships, our initial point of interest remained; the River was a vital site for the formation of relationships and the reproduction of the community. Initially what prompted our interest was that none of the possible sites for resettlement of the Venembeli community were adjacent to a River like the

Wafi. Instead, sites were remote from water sources or only had access to small streams. Our concern and research focus on the importance of the River, uncovered in this and other stories, was that the complex relations between individuals in direct relation with the River and its environs, the Village and indeed the future – remained unseen and unvalued.

Taim mipela luksave long stori insait long ol plenti arapela stori na strongpla relationship, bikpela ass tingting blong mipla istap wankain; Wara em contribute bikpla long bungim man na meri long bungim bodi na kamapim pikinini o marit. Wanem samting kirapim tingting blong mipla em iolsem nogat wanpela eria ol imakim blong resettlemen blong Venembeli kominiti we wara istap arere wankain olsem Wafi Wara. Ol dispela eria ol bai igo sindaun o resettle istap longwe tru long wara o liklik wara tru. Mipela concern na wok painimaut sut long gutpela/importance blong wara, we stori ino bin kamap klia long dispela o arapela stori.

4.3 Women of Venembeli and the big river/Meri long Venembeli na bikpela wara

I feel very strong and am filled with happiness when I stay in the River, and I also see this River is like a mother to me.

Mi pilim strong tru na pulap long amamas taim mi istap long wara, na mi lukim dispela wara iolsem mama bilong mi.

While male speakers dominate mixed community gatherings, when asked, the women of Venembeli were keen to share stories about their daily reality. Some stories were practical accounts of what the River provided, such as protein and fish. Others, like the quote above, were more existential, describing feelings, emotions and human-environmental relationships. Below, the co-researcher commences by identifying the existential before listing nine important attributes that the Wafi River provides to their community, some of which relate to alluvial mining as the main source of funds for women.

Ol Man tasol save toktok plenti long kominiti bung, ol meri long Venembeli wanbel long sharim stori blong how ol save istap. Sampela stori blong wara save givim ol abus o pis. Ol arapla quote istap antap, em tok moa long laip sindaun blong manmeri, toktok long feelings, pilim blong manmeri long bus, graun na wara blong ol. Long aninit, wanpela long ol researcher stat mekim taim luksave long wanem samting em istap pinis em moa important Wafi Wara isave givim long kominiti blong ol. Sampela blong dispela em wok gold o alluvial main em rot blong ol meri long kisim moni.

[insert] Fig. 7 Fishing with traditional net/Painim pis long tumbuna net

As a woman in Venembeli Village I am really very happy about this big river, which is very important to us as it really helps all our livelihood and our body.

Olsem meri long Venembeli ples Mi hamamas bikpela tru long dispela bikpela wara, dispela em important tru long mipela em save helpim mipela long laip na bodi blong mipla.

- 1. Buying roofing iron and materials for building house
Baim kappa na materel blong wokim haus*
- 2. Buying food for family
Baim kaikai blong family*

3. *Buying clothes for family*
Baim klos blong family
4. *Catching fish, eels and prawns for protein*
Kisim pis, malio na kindam blong kaikai
5. *It is also like medicine to us*
Em iwankain olsem marasin long mipela
6. *[A place where] we meet and tell stories, wash and feeling happy and strong*
[Wanpla ples we] mipela save bung na stori, waswas na pilim hamamas na strong
7. *Has a secret place*
Igat hait ples
8. *Meeting place for man (man) and meri (woman) to meet and get married, and also for telling stories*
Ples bung blong man na meri long luksave ol ol yet na marit
9. *Help the church and the government when they ask for support for money*
Helpim sios na gavman taim ol iaskim long sapot long moni

Later she expanded, demonstrating a strong focus on access to river water and as a gift from God where the River was a blessing for the women of Venembeli, saying “(I)n our tok stori today I can see clearly that we women of Venembeli Village and the big river has made our life very easy. We didn’t need to walk far away to find water like women in other places. Thank you for God that he put us in this place and made it so special.”

Bihain em mekim moa stori, soim stongpela lukluk blong wok blong wara na dispela em gift ikam long God we wara em blessing blong ol meri long Venembeli ples, tokaut olsem “ Insait long tok stori tete mi ken luklim ples klia olsem mipela ol meri Venembeli na bikpela wara ibin mekim laip bilong mipela isi tru. Mipela ino ken wakabaut igo longwe long painim wara olsem meri long arapela ples. Tenkyu long God olsem em putim mipela long dispela ples na mekim dispela imoa spesol. ”

The practical list above was a shared one, with many female co-researchers identifying similar points, sometimes during the same *tok stori*, but also in other conversations and across our numerous visits to the community. Other practical River activities and uses include traditional cooking, source of medicine (including surrounding environs), money for school fees, kitchen utensils, *buai* and *speak* (smokes or cigarettes).

Dispela list istap antap em experiens blong plenti meri mekim wok painim aut iluk wankain tasol, Sampela taim long wankain tok stori, na tu long arapela stori insait long plenty wokabaut blong mipela long kominiti. Arapela wok tru blong wara na wanem wok blong wara istap insait long tumbuna rot blong kuk, em olsem marasin (wara na bus graun), moni blong skul fi, samting blong hauskul, buai na toktok (simuk o cigarettes).

Some of these were captured by another co-researcher when she told us,

This big River we still use it the same as our ancestors used to use it. For us women the River

is a special place for us to come together; sharing ideas, meeting boyfriends, washing clothes, blocking the River to catch fish, using traditional ways like cook food with mambo [bamboo] and underground with stone and also work for gold in the River.

*Sampela blong dispela arapela tim researcher karamapim pinis,
Dispela bikpla wara mipela usim wankain olsem ol tumbuna blong mipla save usim.
Long mipela ol meri wara em spesol ples blong mipela kam bung, serim tingting,
bungim boipren, wasim klos, blockim wara na ketchim pis, usim tumbuna pasin long
kukim kaikai long mambo na go aninit long graun wantaim ston na wok gol long wara.*

Another had a very practical list saying “(T)his river each day it give me gold and every day I have money to buy what my family and I need, like salt, sugar, tea and coffee, cooking oil, rice, soap, flour, clothes, school fees, protein, buai and smoke, pots and plate.”

Arapela igat experiens itok “(T)dispel wara wanwan de em givim me gold na olgeta de me gat moni long baim wanem samting famili blong mi na mi nidim, olsem salt, suga,tea na kopi, kuding oil, rice,soap, flour,klos, skulfi, abus, buai na smuk, pot na plate.”

[insert] **Fig 8. Woman fishing/Meri painim pis**

It is, however, the non-physical aspects of living with the River that often remains unseen. While it might be possible for an impact assessment to count the value of alluvial gold or the number of fish caught (see Fig 8.); we asked our co-researchers to *tok stori* about what the River means to women in terms of their own lives? The women shared their personal insights with us:

Dispela em olsem ino samting istap ples klia laip wantaim wara na dispela em ino istap klia long luksave blong man. Dispela ating bai gutpla long stadi blong impact assessment long luksave long value blong wok gol o alluvial gold or namba blong pis ol kisim (lukim piksa 8.); mipla iaskim tim researchers long stori long wara em min wanem long ol meri long laip bilong ol meri? Ol meri iserim wanem tingting blong ol wantaim mipla:

This river is like medicine to me and my family. When we get sick we go swim and recover.

Dispela wara iolsem marasin long mi na famili.Taim mipla isik mipla go swim na kamap orait.

*[After gardening] I hurry to the River and wash away all the dirt and sweat on me.
[Bihain long wok gaden] Mi go hariap long wara na wasim olgeta deti na tuat blong mi.*

*When I am sick I go wash in Wafi River and feel my illness is gone.
Taim mi sik mi go waswas long Wafi wara na pilim sik blong mi pinis.*

The River is stay in the past with our ancestor until today in our generation. Our ancestor use this big River for drinking, cooking, swimming, catching fish, (and) respecting the river's secret place.

Wara istap pinis wantaim ol tumbuna blong mipela inap nau long taim blong mipla. Ol tumbuna blong mipela usim displa bikpla wara long dring, kuk, swim, painim pis, (na) rispekim ples tambu blong wara.

The River is a big strong and power over the land. It's like my mother and help part of my life also. I really see that I am connected to the River with everything in my life. Wara em moa strong na pawa antap long graun. Em iolsem mama bilong mi na helpim hap blong laip blong mi.

These quotes pictured and imagined in relation to village life make it possible to see how relations with each other and the River are more than a simple list of environmental services.

Dispela ol toktok ipiksarim na driman igo insait long laip blong ples na mekim isi long lukim how manmeri na wara ikonek na ino liklik lisst blong environment sevis.

The River nurtures the women of Venembeli but it also helps them achieve independence. As alluded to above (section 4.2) the gendered nature of relationships in PNG can make women more vulnerable. After hearing for many years about the importance of gold to meet daily needs and other expenses (school, health, transport), *tok stori-tok ples* elicited truths about alluvial gold mining as a source of independence for women of Venembeli. In particular, we heard how alluvial gold was important for women's independence as a critical source of funds, especially for single mothers, widows and women whose husbands did not support them adequately. The River was described by one co-researcher as a kind of automatic teller machine where they can pan for alluvial gold to fund expenses as they arise, *"The River is also like a bank to use, from our ancestors until today with us and our children."*

Wara lukautim ol meri long Venembeli na em helpim ol long sanap long leg blong ol yet. Em tok klia long (section 4.2) pasin blong man na meri long PNG ken mekim ol meri isi long bungim hevi. Bihain long plenti yias mipla harim long gutpela blong gold helpim sindaun blong ol olgeta de na arapela expenses(skul, helt,transpot), tok stori-tok ples mekim ples klia trupla blong wok gold mekim ol meri long Venembeli sanap long leg blong ol yet. Long dispela, mipla harim how wok gold em mekim ol meri sanap ol yet na wanpla rot blong kisim moni tub long ol single mama,meri man idai na ol meri we man blong ol ino save helpim ol gut. Wanpla blong ol researcher deskribim wara olsem, ATM we ol ken painim gold long baim samting taim need kamap, "Wara em wankain olsem bank long usim, taim blong tumbuna ikam inap nau wantaim mipla na ol pikinini blong mipla."

This emancipatory role of the River for vulnerable women needs further investigation, both to properly value the complexity of social functions served by the River and also to understand and justly manage impacts on women arising from the mine and its attendant resettlement process. Village relationships were of course heterogenous in nature, some relationships were more equal than others with some women telling stories of working together with their husbands in the garden and gold mining. It is undeniably clear that quotidian relations with the River and its surrounds, just like human relations, are gendered, complex, multifaceted and individual. They require nuanced, culturally sensitive and ontologically accepting eyes and ears if they are to be seen and heard.

Dipela wok blong fridom ol meri painim long wara inidim moa wok painimaut, long luksave long value blong man na meri wara save mekim na impact bai kamap long main na nau hevi blong resettlemen. Long ples prensip em man na meri save mekim boi pren na gel pren, sampela wok poroman kamap

wankain o equal, sampla meri stori long wokbung blong ol wantaim man blong ol long gaden na wok gold. Dispela ikamap klia olsem manmeri konek strong tru wantaim wara, bus na graun, wankain olsem strongpla relationship namel long man na meri moa yet igat kainkain, plenti hanhan na wanpla kain. Dispela nidim strongpla luksave blong kastom long arapela sait ikam daun luksave gut tru sapos ol laik lukim na harim ol gut tru.

4.4 *Kaikai* - Local food, local culture/Ples *kaikai*, *pasin blong ples*

The food lists below (Table 1), identify some of the *gaden* (garden) and *bus* (bush – the surrounding environment) foods eaten in the Village, a process that started with identifying *Tok Ples* foods and then the identification of the corresponding *Tok Pisin* and finally English words. The draft lists were first compiled and recorded in 2019 and enthusiastically checked, corrected and added to in the field visit in 2020 during group-based, open-air activities. As made clear by our community co-researchers there are many more garden and bush foods than those identified here, but these lists of forty garden and bush foods provide a means of illustrating the richness, dependence and strength of physical and cultural connections that the people of Venembeli have on and with the local environment.

Lista blong *kaikai* (Table 1), isoim sampela gaden (garden) na bush *kaikai* ol save *kaikai* long ples, rot blong luksave long Tok Ples *kaikai* na putim long tok pisin na las Tok Englis. Ol draft list igat rekot long 2019 na sekim ol wantaim bel kirap, stretim na bungim ol gen long field visit long 2020 long bikpela grup wok. Ol wanwok kominiti grup researchers tok klia pinis, igat plenti moa gaden na bush *kaikai*, tasol list blong fortipla (40pela) gaden na bus *kaikai* soim dispela richness, independent na strong blong kalsa we man na meri blong Venembeli igat istap na wantaim graun, wara na bus.

Evident from the lists is a degree of specialised knowledge, such as the yams *gembra* and *gora*, the second of which is softer and identified as better for old people and babies. Foods more recently introduced into the garden provide evidence of adaptation, such as the *tamato* with the identifiably English spelling and the introduced taro *garam*. Bush foods are much in demand as a protein source and are known as *abus* in *Tok Pisin*, literally translated as protein. These range from the more exotic *bus*, such as *gii* (beetles) and *busip* (cat), to the more frequent favourite of *weyambe* (eel), caught in abundance from the River and smoked while we stayed in the Village.

Ples klia long list em ol spesol save, olsem yam *gembra* na *gora*, second em moa malmalung na gutpla blong lapun manmeri na bebi long *kaikai*. *Kaikai* nau tasol ol kisim ol kam insait long ples na planim long gaden soim senis o adaptation, olsem *tamato* wantaim English spelling na taro *garam* tu ikam nupela. *Kaikai* blong bush em istap long bikpela demand olsem *abus*, *abus* long Tok Pisin, *abus* em protein. Sampela *abus* em nupla ol kam long narapla hap bus oslem *gii* (binatang/beetles) na *busip* (cat) pusi, wantaim *abus* blong ol *weyambe* (eel) malio, ol save kisim plenty long wara na ol simukim long paia ples taim mipla istap long ples.

Miyo (*Tok Pisin-Marita*, English-Pandanus) is a good example of food that is more than sustenance; a celebrated food that fulfils not just the function of improving flavour, but also marks a cultural event. On one visit, to prepare a pandanus meal as a special treat for the research team, a group of women and children walked to garden and bush to obtain food and the pandanus flowers, which were then collectively processed down by the River. That evening the pandanus sauce was used to improve the usual rice, *niyang* (taro) and *neg* (leafy green vegetables) meal for the visiting researchers. There were questions and evident curiosity regarding the team's enjoyment and views on the local speciality, not just from those we shared the meal with, but other community members who knew that it was being prepared for us and those that had helped harvest and prepare the meal. At an earlier visit, the pandanus

was one of the foods drawn (Fig 9.) by a co-researcher, alongside the *tok ples* and *to pisin* words and an explanation that translates as, ‘sauce to flavour food’. There are five different types of *Miyo*, which grows in wet soils both in the Village and the bush, though generally people just refer to red or yellow varieties.

Miyo (Tok Pisin-Marita, English-Pandanus, em gutpla example blong gutpela sindaun, em kastom kaikai ino long taste or swit tasol em save kamapim kastom bung. Long wanpla wakabaut, ol redim kaikai wantaim marita olsem spesol treatment long research tim na ol meri na pikinini save go long gaden na bus long kisim marita na redim long wara. Long dispela abinun gris blong marita ol ikukim rice, niyang (taro) na neg (lip kumu) blong ol visita o research tim. Plenti bel kirap na askim research team long tingting na lukluk blong tumbuna kaikai, ino ol lain we mipla serim kaikai wantaim, ol arapela man na meri insait long kominit harim olsem marita ol redim blong mipla, na ol lain husait helpim na redim marita blong mipla long kaikai. Long narapla visit, marita em wanpla kaikai, wanpla tim memba luksave (Fig 9.) wantaim tok ples tok pisin na mining olsem “sauce blong switim kaikai”. Igat 5pla (faiv) arapela kain miyo (marita) em save grow long malmalum graun long ples and bus. Plenti manmeri save tok marita em red na yellow tasol.

[insert] **Fig. 9 Miyo/Marita**

[insert] **Table 1. Garden and Bush Foods eaten in Venembeli/ Tebol 1. Gaden na Bus kaikai ol kaikai long Venembeli**

5. Discussion

These stories and pictures you draw will not only tell our future generations, but inform the rest of the world that such places like Venembeli exist and has a land that is rich, diverse and abundant.

Dispela ol stori na piksa yu kisim bai no mekim stori blong ol pikinini ikam bihain tasol nogat, em bai tokaut long arapela lain long ples graun, igat wanpla ples olsem Venembeli istap em rich na igat graun pulap long plenti samting.

The quote above was directed at the male youth (young men) of Venembeli by a man in his late twenties, exhorting them to value their identity and culture and to think about the welfare of future generations - but it applies equally well to our purposeful intent here. For, in identifying and responding to ‘blindness’, where unseen existences were overlooked and undervalued by mining companies, we have sought to share stories from Venembeli as it exists now, on the temporal precipice of industrial mining. Having been privileged to visit and live amongst the Venembeli community, we see in these stories glimpses of life, depicting complex relations between humans and the non-human that are essential to individual and collective human flourishing. Our aim was to tell stories from Venembeli and in so doing, to challenge the two-dimensional rendering of life that is the hallmark of impact assessment. To create a space where potential impacts and negative mining legacies could be seen and understood in relation to the life of a community.

Dispela quote antap igo long yangpla man long Venembeli long wanpla man igat moa long 25pla krismas, mekim ol luksave long value na ol yet husait, kastom na tingting long gutpla blong pikinini ikam bihain- na em kam gut tru wantaim wok blong mipla long hia. Long putim ples klia aipas blong

main kampani, mipla mekim long serim stori blong Venembeli nau em istap long stip maunten na sotpla taim bai bikpla mining kampani kisim ples. Mipela igat sans long lukim na istap long Venembeli komnti na lukim tu long ol stori bilong laip sindaun, poroman namel long manmeri na arapla em moa important long wanpla narapla o gutpla sindaun. Aim blong mipla long toktok o stori blong Venembeli na tu long challengim tupla side gutpla na bagarap bai ikamap. Dispela bai kamapim spes blong possible impacts na nogut main bai mekim long lukim na save long sindaun blong manmeri long kominiti.

The four *tok stori* above cover various aspects of life in Venembeli: *Kaikai* from the garden and bush of enormous variety that provides physical and cultural nourishment; *Taim blong bung na stori* as the means for transgressing traditional gendered social norms, individual freedom and the future of the Village; *Pikininis* who play and grow in the presence of the River, giving another meaning to the concept of River as Mother; and *Meri* who grow the food, raise the children and sustain the community, nurtured by the “big river”. Within these stories we can see (or imagine) children playing, cultural feasts, environmental dependence, domestic chores and women’s financial independence – all crucial moments of locally defined *gutpla sindaun* (human flourishing). These stories of existence are part of Venembeli’s story as it is now, existing alongside mineral exploration; offering a glimpse of life in Venembeli before mining and the inevitable dispossession, displacement and fragmentation of a community. We contend, that without further explication, these stories tell a truth about relational complexity and of the need to understand communities in their own locale, with their own values, ambitions and of ways of being. Impact assessments that fail to engage with local livelihoods and knowledge systems, continue a negative legacy of colonialism and Western imperialism, subjecting people to alien ways and views without even the grace to see and value theirs.

Foapla (4pla) tok stori antap karamapim arapla sait blong laip long Venembeli: *Kaikai* blong gaden na bus wantaim plenti arapela kain *kaikai* save givim strong blong bodi na strongim tu kasom; *Taim blong bung na stori* olsem rot blong man na meri, samap long leg blong yu yet (fridom) na bihain taim blong ples; *Pikini* husait pilai na grow wantaim wara, givim narapla mining long Wara em Mama; na *Meri* husait groim *kaikai*, lukautim *pikinini* na kominiti, “*Bikpla Wara em laip.*” Insait long ol stori mipela iken lukim (or driman) *pikinini* pilai, kastom *kaikai*, graun bus na wara givim yumi, stori blong haus na meri igat moni sanap long lek blong ol yet- olgeta dispela givim mining blong *gutpla sindaun* (human flourishing). Dispela stori blong laip em blong Venembeli long nau, istap namel long wok painimaut blong main; givim lukluk moa igo insait long laip long Venembeli bipo long main iken rausim, bagarapim, putim ol long narapla ples, brukim kominiti. Mipla holim strong wantaim wok skelim, dispela ol stori tokaut long Tok itru long how ol pasin o tingting em plenti, igat nid long save moa long kominitis long wei blong ol, wantaim ol values, laip sindaun blong ol. Impact assessment ino bin engage long sindaun blong manmeri long ples na displa em ino stret, controlim ol long autsait

It is difficult to disentangle the approach of *tok stori-tok ples* from our ongoing and multi-year relationships and commitment, which provided the foundation for its deliberate application. Of many possible explanations we suspect that our intentional recognition of the importance of local knowledge clarified our previous engagements and relationships. Arguably, this increased the power of the community who then reciprocally returned our recognition of value and respect. It seems that by us respecting their knowledge and ways of being, it elevated their own knowledge and culture in their own minds. This idea was prompted through the process of sharing *tok stori*’s and feedback from the community;

Em ino isi long separatism wok blong tok stori-tok ples long ol wok blong mipla long plenti yia wok poroman na komitmen dispela mekim isi long kamap long kain mak oslem. Taim wok blong mipla kam

klia mipla ting olsem, gutpela blong local knowledge (save blong ples) mekim wok isi. Dispela givim moa pawa long komuniti na ol givim bek luksave long value na rispekt. Em luk olsem mipla respektim save na pasin blong ol, displa kirapim save blong ol yet na kastom blong ol long tingting blong ol yet. Displa tinting kamap long rot blong serim tok stori (ol toktok) na fidbek ikam long komuniti.

Your research team with Murdoch [University] helps us to see the good of our culture, traditional billum, medicine, ways of respect and share food, care for others. Research tim blong yu wantaim Murdoch (Univesti) helpim mipla long lukim gutpela bling kalsa, tumbuna billum, marasin, pasin rispekt na serim kaikai, lukautim arapela.

You team come and live with us and we learn from you many good information. [The] Community realise you come here to help us think about the future. Our youths and everyone respect your work that is helpful to the people today and tomorrow. Yupla tim kam na istap wantaim mipela na mipla lainim save long yu plenty gutpla informesen. Komuniti luksave yu kam hia long helpim mipela long bihain blong mipla, Yuts blong mipla na olgeta manmeri rispektim wok blong yupla na displa em helpful long ol manmeri tete na tomoro.

Today in our tok stori I really see the importance of the river, it is not separate us human beings from the land. We all connect with water and land. Water or River has a very big role in our life as women.

Tete long tok stori blong yumi, mi lukim tru gutpela o importance blong wara, em ino inap separatism yumi manmeri long graun. Mipla olgeta konek wantaim wara na graun. Wara igat bikpela moa wok long laip long yumi olsem meri.

This is not to cast the research team as good, or powerful, but as mere practitioners who valued the local when the march of Western dominance fails to acknowledge different ways of seeing or being in the world. In other words, our process looked good only because the usual processes are inadequate. Dispela ino blong mekim research tim luk good o pawaful, tim givim bikpela luksave long manmeri long ples taim utsait influens fail long givim kain luksave long plenti arapela rot blong lukim long ples graun. Process blong mipla luk gut bikos nomal process ino orait.

In comparison, we ask whether the procedural blindness of the extractive industries is wilful or perhaps just a result of the banality of corporate structures and motivations. Regardless, the outcome is that corporate processes fail to see communities as they are. While we are unable to examine the ethics of agency within impact assessments here, the inability of individual agency to overcome procedural or structurally entrenched injustices and inequalities demands further attention; a discussion which we plan to contribute to in the future.

Long skelim, kampani long utsait ikam insait bihainim tingting blong ol yet na fail long luksave gut long komuniti olsem ol husait. Taim mipla ino lukluk long nogut na gutpla insait long impact assessment igat nid long luksave na igat toktok mipela plen long contribute long bihain.

Finally, while these stories cannot make life in Venembeli fully visible, their purpose will be served if they prompt the imagination and allow readers and stakeholders to see how lives need to be understood within their own context and ways of being.

Last tru, ol dispela stori ino inap mekim laip long Venembeli kam klia, wok blong ol bai kamap sapos kirapim tingting o driman na ol readers na stakeholders long lukim how laip bai istap long level na pasin blong ol.

How could an outside actor understand the importance of the Wafi River if they are unable to see the many connections and functions the River serves the Venembeli community, from courtship to education, child minding, an escape from the heat and a source of independence for women?

How bai autsait lain save long importance blong Wafi Wara, sapos ol ino luksave long plenti samting na wok Wara givim long Venembeli kominiti, man na meri bungim ol yet/bungim bodi, save, lukautim pikinini, waswas, rot blong ol meri sanap long lek blong ol yet?

What is certain, is that having participated in this research, the Venembeli community has a renewed awareness of the local sources of human flourishing. This awareness and valuation of the local faces significant pressure as the desire for development and modernity, combined with impact assessments that are underpinned by Western values, act to devalue the very sources of human flourishing that sustain the community; a fact further complicated by unrealistic expectations and the inability of extractive industries to deliver.

Mipela iluksave klia insait long dispel research olsem, Venembeli kominiti igat nupela skelim na lukluk long gutpela sindaun long ples blong ol. Dispela awareness na wok skelim kamap save blong ples na bump wantaim tingting blong senis o autsait divilopmen lukdaun long gutpela sindaun blong kominiti; manmeri igat bikipela tingting long kampani bai givim tasol kampani ino inap long givim servis ol ilaikim.

Critical to understanding this is that while this mine (like Ramu Nickel) will bring development, the well-being of the community will still be overwhelmingly dependent on social connections and environmental goods, see Fig 10.. Further research efforts that explicitly value and embrace local knowledge and ways of being, rather than ignore them, will assist communities and other stakeholders to ensure mining enhances the human flourishing of communities, generating positive rather than negative mining legacies.

Em ino isi long save em olsem taim dispela main (olsem Ramu Nickel) bai bring divilopmen, gutpela sindaun blong kominiti em bai sanap strong wokbung blong manmeri na bus, graun na wara blong ol, lukim Fig 10. Research wok tokaut olsem lokol save na pasin blong ples igat namba/value na ino long rabisim save blong ples, bai helpim kominitis na stakeholders olsem Mining tu sapatim gutpla sindaun blong kominitis, kirapim gutpela senis na ino stori nogut blong main.

[insert] **Fig 10. Venembeli II**